

---

Review

Reviewed Work(s): *We Are What We Drink: The Temperance Battle in Minnesota* by Sabine N. Meyer

Review by: David M. Fahey

Source: *Journal of American Ethnic History*, Vol. 36, No. 1 (Fall 2016), pp. 109-111

Published by: University of Illinois Press on behalf of the Immigration & Ethnic History Society

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5406/jamerethnhist.36.1.0109>

Accessed: 19-01-2017 15:46 UTC

---

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at

<http://about.jstor.org/terms>



*Immigration & Ethnic History Society*, *University of Illinois Press* are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Journal of American Ethnic History*

ing as it does on the distinction between race and color developed by immigration historians like Matthew Frye Jacobson and Thomas Guglielmo. Given the centrality (and violence) of white interactions with people of color in both Australia and the United States in this era, however, McMahon is also keen to track the views of the Young Ireland editors on questions like slavery and abolition, African American rights during Reconstruction, efforts at Chinese exclusion, and the treatment of Indigenous peoples in America and the Antipodes. Without disputing the power of white supremacy in these years, he effectively demonstrates that there was a greater variety of opinion on some of these questions than has generally been recognized. He shows, for example, that the extreme pro-slavery views of the editor John Mitchel were not representative of the views of Irish immigrants generally (as some scholars have assumed), and that these views were challenged and contested at the time by other members of the Young Ireland cohort.

McMahon also argues that the racial discourse of Celts and Saxons at the center of his concept of Irish global nationalism was “marked by paradox and contradiction,” on some occasions emphasizing a primordial ethnic solidarity, while on others articulating an early version of what would later be called “civic pluralism” (p. 2). More research would be necessary to fully substantiate this last point, but it nicely illustrates the complex and wide-ranging character of McMahon’s work as a whole. There are some problems in the book, among them a tendency on occasion to overstate the case; it is hard, for example, to see the Irish Repeal leader Daniel O’Connell, who declined to take up the cause of the threatened Irish language and who admired the young (“Saxon”) Queen Victoria and defended her empire, as exemplifying a “Celtic” racial consciousness. McMahon’s frequent use of the adjective “worldwide” when referring to the press in just three Anglophone locales is another example of such overstatement. On the other hand, his detailed discussion of the mechanics of international communication among newspaper editors (subscription exchanges, the clipping and reprinting of news and opinion, the employment of traveling subscription agents, etc.) makes for fascinating reading. All in all, this is an ambitious and accomplished work of historical analysis.

David Brundage  
University of California, Santa Cruz

***We Are What We Drink: The Temperance Battle in Minnesota.*** By Sabine N.

Meyer. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2015. xix + 269 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, and index. \$55 (cloth).

Sabine N. Meyer is a German scholar who teaches American studies at the University of Osnabrück. Despite its subtitle, her splendid book is much more than a survey of temperance in a midwestern state. Thirteen years ago, the then director

of the University of Minnesota's Immigration Research History Center, Rudolph J. Vecoli, encouraged her to study ethnic history through the prism of drink and temperance. Supported by massive archival and rare print research, Meyer critiques the work of other historians and sociologists. Although she constructs a story rich in detail, she keeps her focus on identity. "The interpretation of the temperance movement as a catalyst of identity construction and negotiation enhances our conceptualization of identity itself" (p. 202).

Meyer makes a major contribution to temperance and ethnic history through her case study of the Minnesota capital, St. Paul, from the 1820s to 1919. Unlike its neighbor Minneapolis, St. Paul was an anti-temperance stronghold where anti-drink reformers struggled as an embattled minority. The Twin Cities had contrasting civic identities. For Meyer, place is important in the story of identity, with temperance reform "an intensely local experience" (p. 198).

Meyer is critical of earlier temperance histories that, describing a moral crusade by middle-class Protestant Anglo-Americans, privilege class and religion at the expense of ethnicity, gender, and place. "Not a single study examines the temperance movement from an interethnic perspective" (p. 3). In contrast, Meyer analyzes "the connections between the temperance movement and the construction of the ethnic identities among Minnesota's Irish and German Americans" (p. 8). She joins recent historians in rehabilitating the reputation of the Women's Christian Temperance Union (WCTU). In its evolving public/private paradigm, it developed a feminist ideology that it shared with suffragists. In Minnesota, the WCTU consisted of women whose various identities reinforced one another: Anglo-American, pietistic Protestant, and middle-class.

German Americans created an identity in which beer was central. Although their motto was personal liberty, they saw their defense of beer as more than a matter of individual rights. It was a defense of Germans as a people. Laws restricting or prohibiting drink were nativist attacks on German culture and German businesses. The fight against High License (enacted 1887) and a Minnesota version of the Ohio Liquor Law helped fuse together Germans of different religions and origins. In the nineteenth century, only the German American pietistic denominations supported total abstinence and Prohibition. German anti-temperance reached its climax with the organization of the Deutsch-Amerikanischer Zentralbund (ZB) in 1899. The ZB even recruited women. This was a false dawn, as German Catholics held aloof. Religion proved a more powerful identity than did ethnicity.

In contrast to the German American story, an important minority of Irish Americans, some of them laborers, saw "temperance as a path to spiritual and material self-improvement" (p. 73). Renegotiating their ethnic identities, Irish temperance reformers won the respect of Anglo-American Protestants. Few German Catholics or Catholics of other ethnicities joined Catholic temperance organizations. They were overwhelmingly Irish societies. Eventually, Irish women joined their menfolk. By the turn of the century, Irish Americans had become sufficiently accepted into

Anglo-American Protestant society so that they no longer needed temperance to obtain respectability. Irish interest in teetotalism declined, especially among men.

In 1898, the fortunes of the Minnesota temperance movement rose with the election of a Progressive governor. Temperance could fit well into Progressivism. In the same year, Minnesota's Anti-Saloon League was founded. It was a professionally staffed, pragmatic organization that argued for the elimination of the saloon through local option, and did not demand state Prohibition. In 1915, the state legislature enacted County Option.

Although the wartime Minnesota Commission of Public Safety was not intended to destroy the drink trade, many of its orders contributed to dry objectives. Despite the apparent temperance triumph, when a Prohibition constitutional amendment was put before the voters in 1918, it failed to get a sufficient majority to become law. National Prohibition soon followed. It was largely ignored in St. Paul. "By the early 1920s the 'Sainted City' had once again gained national renown as one of the wettest cities in the country" (p. 185).

Although her book is mostly about ethnicity, Meyer says comparatively little about Scandinavians and Finns, presumably because she does not read the languages in which their newspapers and other sources were written. She mentions French Canadians when, in the early 1850s, a French-born bishop attempted to organize a Catholic total abstinence society. These are minor criticisms.

David M. Fahey  
Miami University (Ohio)

***Race, Religion, and the Pulpit: The Reverend Robert L. Bradby and the Making of Urban Detroit, 1910–1946.*** By Julia Marie Robinson. Detroit, MI: Wayne State University Press, 2015. xvi + 200 pp. Photos, notes, bibliography, and index. \$39.99 (cloth).

Julia Marie Robinson's study of the Rev. Robert L. Bradby, minister of Detroit's Second Baptist Church from 1910 until his death in 1946, unearths valuable material useful to a range of scholarly interests. Bradby was a prominent public figure, renowned preacher, masterful employment patron, and celebrated civil rights leader. Furthermore, as this review is being written in the weeks after Rachel Dolezal unwittingly drew national attention for having "passed" as black, Robinson provides a fascinating narrative of the logic of racial classification by which Bradby self-identified as a "Negro" despite his parents identifying as Native American and white, and she contextualizes Bradby's reception by most in his African American congregation as a fellow "Negro."

Historians will be interested in Robinson's attention to the performance of class in the lives of Second Baptist's congregants and the African American community of Detroit. Several sections of the book read like a case study for Kevin Gaines's